

## Lesson 5 - How Do You Feel About Reparations?

### Lesson Summary

Students will engage with the issue of reparations sparked by the personal experiences and views in the documentary “The Cost of Inheritance.” Students will access additional scholarly sources to explore, express, and then discuss their views on reparations centered on the enslavement, segregation and other injustices experienced by Black Americans. The paper, and then the Socratic Seminar discussion should address one, some, or all the following questions:

- What are reparations?
- What is the historical context for reparations in the United States?
- Should the government issue reparations at all?
- What should reparations look like? Should they be financial? Should they take some other form?
- Who should receive these reparations? All Black people? People who could prove ties to enslavement? People with ancestors who have been in the country since 1865 or earlier.
- Who should pay for these reparations? General tax funding? Specific groups? How will this be enacted and enforced?
- Would reparations ever be enough to create justice in these circumstances?

### Objective

- Students will write an academic paper, the goal of which is to express their views on reparations in the United States with regards to enslavement, segregation, and other injustices experienced by Black Americans. The paper should be written in the third person, in an academic tone of voice. **Arguments made in the paper should be rooted in historical, ethical, and philosophical reasoning using at least three sources included in the “Materials” section.**
- Students will engage in a Socratic Seminar discussion on the topic of reparations. To prepare for the discussion, students will consult sources, think about the multiple perspectives offered and write a position paper on the topic of reparations.

### Standards

8.3.12.B. Evaluate the impact of historical documents, artifacts, and places in U.S. history which are critical to world history.

8.3.U.A. Compare the role groups and individuals played in the social, political, cultural, and economic development of the U.S.

8.3.12.D. Evaluate how conflict and cooperation among groups and organizations in the U.S. have influenced the growth and development of the world. • Ethnicity and race • Working conditions • Immigration • Military conflict • Economic stability

### Vocabulary

**Reparations:** 1- a repairing or keeping in repair. 2- the act of making amends, offering expiation, or giving satisfaction for a wrong or injury or something done or given as amends or satisfaction 3- the

payment of damages, specifically: compensation in money or materials payable by a defeated nation for damages to or expenditures sustained by another nation as a result of hostilities with the defeated nation —usually used in plural

**Justice:** the maintenance or administration of what is just especially by the impartial adjustment of conflicting claims or the assignment of merited rewards or punishments

**Enslavement:** to force into or as if into slavery

**Segregation:** the separation or isolation of a race, class, or ethnic group by enforced or voluntary residence in a restricted area, by barriers to social intercourse, by separate educational facilities, or by other discriminatory means

**Reconstruction:** the period from 1865 to 1877 in which the southern states that had seceded during the American Civil War rejoined the United States

**Jim Crow:** racial segregation and discrimination enforced by laws, customs, and practices in especially the southern states of the U.S. from the end of Reconstruction in 1877 until the mid-20th century

Definitions sourced from Merriam Webster

### Episode Information

The Cost of Inheritance: Video Extras <https://www.wqed.org/the-cost-of-inheritance/>

1. Ties To The Land – features Patt Gunn, Sarah Eisner and Randy Quarterman.
2. Working to Pass HR 40: Rep. Sheila Jackson Lee

### Materials

1. Ta-Nehisi Coates Opening Statement on Reparations at House Hearing  
[www.youtube.com/watch?v=kcCnQ3iRkys](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kcCnQ3iRkys)
2. **Congress passes a resolution apologizing for enslavement, segregation.** S. Con. Res. 26-111<sup>th</sup> Congress 1<sup>st</sup> Session <https://www.congress.gov/bill/111th-congress/senate-concurrent-resolution/26>
3. **Ta- Nehisi Coates makes the case for reparations in the Atlantic 2014.**  
[www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2014/06/the-case-for-reparations/361631/](http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2014/06/the-case-for-reparations/361631/)
4. **MLK Jr. Speaks on the topic of Reparations** [www.youtube.com/watch?v=NNvzVCVhIM](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NNvzVCVhIM)  
OR search "'Martin Luther King Explains 'Reparations'" on YouTube. It is the 1:18 minute long video of MLK Jr. Speaking.
5. **MLK Jr. On Obstacles Black Americans face**  
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3xD8vWQJEok&t=1s> OR search "MLK-"It's a cruel jest to say to a bootless man that he ought to lift himself by his own bootstraps"- it is the 2:04 minute video of MLK Jr. speaking in a church.
6. **NAACP Website on Reparations** <https://naacp.org/resources/reparations>
7. **Malcolm X presents the Nation of Islam call for reparations. Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan. 23 January 1963.** Transcribed text from audio excerpt. SOURCE: X, Malcolm. "The Race Problem." African Students Association and NAACP Campus Chapter. Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan. 23 January 1963.  
<https://ccnmtl.columbia.edu/projects/mmt/mxp/speeches/mxt24.html>

The above sources are to be given to students to engage with. These can be given out via links or a slideshow for students to access to use as evidence in their papers and during their Socratic seminar. They can also be reviewed as a class if time allows. In addition to these sources, students could also use information from *The Cost of Inheritance* or find their own sources if given time to research.

- Reparations Position Paper Rubric
- Socratic Seminar Discussion Rubric
- Socratic Seminar Reading Notes/Questions handout
- PowerPoint Slides: "A Brief Modern History of Reparations"

## Lesson Activity

### Teacher Prep

- Preview The Cost of Inheritance video excerpts.
- View and read listed sources.

## Lesson Tips

Present PowerPoint Slides: “A Brief Modern History of Reparations” to offer historical context for reparations.

## Background Information

This lesson 5 is the culminating lesson on reparations.

## Introduction

Students will write an academic paper, the goal of which is to express their views on reparations in the United States with regards to enslavement, segregation, and other injustices experienced by Black Americans. The paper should be written in the third person, in an academic tone of voice.

**Arguments made in the paper should be rooted in historical, ethical, and philosophical reasoning using at least three sources included in the “Materials” section.**

Students will engage in a Socratic Seminar discussion on the topic of reparations. To prepare for the discussion, students will consult sources, think about the multiple perspectives offered and write a position paper on the topic of reparations.

## Instructions

See “Guiding Student Inquiry”

1. Assist students in accessing, assessing, taking notes and citing relevant scholarly sources from materials section
2. Model how to formulate a research question based on this research. Utilize I-Search from University of Pennsylvania. Have students ask themselves what they are left wondering after reviewing the sources. What are they curious about and what do they want to learn more about.
3. Students will create an essay on this subject with a research question they formulate
  - a. Can take the form of a letter to government attempting to sway them one way or the other in their policy or can even take the form of a video essay as long as sources are still properly cited
  - b. Cite timestamps in film or page numbers in text sources
  - c. Should use at least 4 scholarly sources from the materials section and documentary
  - d. See Reparations Position Paper rubric
4. Once students have completed their academic essay, engage in a Socratic seminar as a whole class
  - a. Review norms around courageous conversations
  - b. Provide some norms, but encourage class to come up with their rules they would like to employ
  - c. Examples:
    - i. Input should be based in scholarly sources
    - ii. Assume positive intent, but acknowledge impact
    - iii. Only one person speaks at a time

See Socratic Seminar Rubric

## Guiding Student Inquiry

### **Before Activity**

How do you feel about reparations?

### **During Activity**

Students choose the topic of their interest within this subject

### **After Activity**

Socratic Seminar: What are our norms around courageous conversations

- d. Provide some norms, but encourage class to come up with their rules they would like to employ
- e. Examples:
  - i. Input should be based in scholarly sources
  - ii. Assume positive intent, but acknowledge impact
  - iii. Only one person speaks at a time

See Socratic Seminar Rubric

## Check for Understanding

Reparations Position Paper Rubric AND Socratic Seminar Discussion Rubric

*Lesson plan created by Erin Breault and Jules Jacques*

## Socratic Seminar Reading Notes/Questions

Name:

Seminar Title:

### A. Socratic Seminar Reading Notes:

- 1) Read the assigned pages, marking passages that are most important in relation to the main ideas of the article.
- 2) Write comments and questions in the margins.
- 3) Go back over the readings and find the 6 passages that you find most important or interesting. Record the first three and last three words of each passage with ellipses in between, as well as the section of the page (top, middle, bottom) in the table below.
- 4) Summarize the passage, then add comments and/or questions related to each of these. Average 3-4 sentences per comment. This should include your ideas and reflections.

<b>Author, Page # and section of the page</b>	<b>List</b> Passages related to the questions or others that interest or confuse you?	<b>Summarize:</b> What is it saying? What do you think it means?	<b>Comment:</b> What do you think about it? Why did you choose it? Why does it confuse you? What questions do you have?


### Reparations Position Paper Rubric

Use: This rubric will be used to grade your essay. Use it to guide your writing. **Keep in mind the requirements: Academic tone (third person), two pages double spaced (12 point times new roman), reference at a minimum three of the sources provided on the topic, and answers one or more of the questions provided (see schoology).**

Category	4	3	2	1	0
Response to Prompt, use of historical, philosophical, and ethic arguments	Student response answers one or more questions listed in prompt in a meaningful way	Student response answers one or more questions listed in prompt , falling short of full points for depth	Student response answers one or more questions, but their response lacks depth, and is surface level	Student attempts to respond to one of the questions, but does not answer in a meaningful way	Student's response has no relation to the prompt
Use of Sources	Student uses the minimum three sources	Student uses two source	Student uses one source	Student makes reference to a source but does not analyze	Student does not make reference to any source
Length	Paper is the required two pages, double space	Paper is 1.5 pages in length	Paper is 1 page in length	Paper is .5 pages in length	Paper is a paragraph length or less
Writing mechanics, grammar, prose, spelling	Response has few errors, and has clearly been edited	Response has multiple errors	Response has a high number of errors	Response has a high number of errors, and appears not to have been edited	Response is so filled with errors that it cannot be understood
Academic tone of voice/ argumentation	Student uses third person only, maintains academic tone	Student almost exclusively uses third person, academic tone	Student uses a mix of first and third pearson, tone varies	Student uses mostly first person, tone varies	Student uses a causal, personal tone, totally lacking academic tone

**See back for grade/comments**



Grade: /20

Additional comments:

Name of Group Member Observed: \_\_\_\_\_

Assignment: \_\_\_\_\_

**Background:** A Socratic seminar is a motivating form of scholarly discourse based on “essential” open-ended questions. Essential questions are defined as questions that get at the heart of a topic and its controversies and that generate multiple answers and perspectives. To participate you must first examine a text (primary or secondary source) and generate open-ended, higher-level questions for discussion of the text. Open-ended questions include “How?” and “Why?” and allow you to think critically, analyze multiple meanings in the text, and express your ideas and opinions with clarity and confidence. During the seminar, listen attentively and respond to one another with respect. Before agreeing or disagreeing with a classmate, summarize that classmate’s ideas/opinions, and then express your own with clarity and **supporting evidence from the text.**

**1. Listening**

- Interrupts; doesn’t restate; side-bar conversations \_\_\_\_\_
- Sometimes interrupts; restates; asks for contributions \_\_\_\_\_
- Often restates; usually doesn’t interrupt \_\_\_\_\_
- Routinely restates, asks for contributions; rarely interrupts \_\_\_\_\_

**2. Number of Comments**

- No comments \_\_\_\_\_
- 1 comment \_\_\_\_\_
- 2 comments \_\_\_\_\_
- 3 comments \_\_\_\_\_
- 4 or more comments \_\_\_\_\_

**3. Quality of Ideas Expressed**

- No comments \_\_\_\_\_
- Just repeats others’ ideas \_\_\_\_\_
- Expresses original ideas \_\_\_\_\_
- Original, deep, new ideas \_\_\_\_\_

**4. References to Text**

- No references \_\_\_\_\_
- 1-2 references \_\_\_\_\_
- 3 references \_\_\_\_\_
- 4 or more references \_\_\_\_\_

5. Write a response to a comment that you didn't get to respond to during the seminar. (15 points)

6. Attach your class generated list discussion questions and the answers you wrote for each. (30 points)

7. Write a reflection of your participation in the Socratic seminar discussion of \_\_\_\_\_ . (10 points)